

3.0 COST OF PROVIDING SERVICES AND SERVICE LEVEL COMPARISONS

As part of this MSR, each agency’s cost to provide services and the level of services being provided was compared. Specific details about each agency’s service provision and the specific services and facilities being provided are included within each agency’s section of this MSR. This section provides an overview and comparison of the level of services being provided and at what cost. Table 3.A provides a summary of the cities included in this MSR, the services currently being provided, and the cost of providing the services in Fiscal Year (FY) 2004–05 per capita.

Table 3.A: Summary of Cities’ Cost of Providing Services Per Capita for Fiscal Year 2004–05

	Banning	Beaumont	Calimesa	Hemet	Moreno Valley	Murrieta	Perris	San Jacinto	Temecula
2005 Population	27,954	18,982	7,434	66,455	165,328	85,102	44,594	28,437	81,397
Cost of Service									
Law Enforcement	\$170.00	\$227.58	\$132.05	\$211.72	\$147.95	\$140.11	\$163.88	\$167.36	\$166.05
Fire	\$60.22	\$56.37	\$104.35	\$122.72	\$56.10	\$75.86	\$39.27	\$36.74	\$62.43
Parks & Recreation	\$25.78	\$62.90	\$10.65	\$11.20	\$40.02	\$69.77	\$32.32	\$38.84	\$92.01
Library	Not provided	Not provided	*	\$24.94	\$10.12	\$9.61	*	*	*
Street Maintenance	\$66.83	\$50.05	\$57.48	\$27.31	\$19.54	\$11.68	\$12.72	\$26.95	\$65.31
Animal Control	\$4.44	\$6.32	\$1.88	\$2.31	\$10.40	\$1.34	\$8.33	n/a	\$1.84
Total Revenues	\$2,203.58	\$796.12	\$432.13	\$1,138.51	\$486.52	\$978.94	\$446.97	\$1,001.69	\$940.56
Total Expenditures	\$2,153.86	\$785.96	\$409.58	\$1,097.19	\$403.70	\$1,295.88	\$447.57	\$1,305.35	\$927.77

Source: State of California, Department of Finance, E-5 City/County Population and Housing Estimates, 2005, Revised 2001-2004, with 2000 DRU Benchmark. Sacramento, California, May 2005.

Source: Adopted Budget and/or Financial Audits for each city for Fiscal Year 2004–05.

*Cities that contract with the Riverside County Library System. Services are funded through a Library District Tax, which is levied throughout all unincorporated areas and the contract cities

Law Enforcement Service Comparison

Law enforcement services within the MSR area are provided by city police departments, city and district contracts with the Riverside County Sheriff Department, and directly by the Riverside County Sheriff’s Department within unincorporated areas not being serviced by a County Service Area (CSA) or district. The Sheriff’s Department’s adopted service standard is 1.2 full-time deputies per 1,000 residents. However, the actual service ratio varies daily due to fluctuations in staffing. Tables 3.B and 3.C provide a comparison of law enforcement service levels within the MSR area. It should be noted that the response times provided by the Riverside County Sheriff’s Department are times from when the call was assigned to a deputy to when the deputy arrives on scene. In addition to the cost information in Table 3.A, the Santa Rosa Community Service District (CSD) provides supplemental law enforcement services (2 deputies) at a cost of \$16.32 per acre annually.

Table 3.B: Law Enforcement Staffing Comparison

Law Enforcement Services Provided through Contract with Riverside County Sheriff’s Department						
	Calimesa	Moreno Valley	Perris	San Jacinto	Santa Rosa CSD	Temecula
Contracted Sworn Officers	30 hours per day = 6.2 deputies	147	40	17	2	76
Adopted Service Standard	0.921 to 1.0	1.0	1.0	None	None	1.0
Current Level of Service	Approximately 0.83	0.90	1.0	1.08	N/A - 1,000 developed parcels	0.93
Law Enforcement Services Provided by City Police Departments						
	Banning	Beaumont	Hemet	Murrieta		
Number of Sworn Officers	35	34	82	74		
Adopted Service Standard	1.40	None	1.30	1.0		
Current Level of Service	1.25	1.79	1.21	0.87		

Note: Service standards and levels of service are per 1,000 population.

Table 3.C: Law Enforcement Response Times (Fiscal Year 2004–05)

Area	Priority One	Priority Two	Priority Three
Response Times to Calls for Cities Contracting with the Riverside County Sheriff			
Calimesa	3.87 minutes	6.66 minutes	11.34 minutes
Moreno Valley	5.71 minutes	10.10 minutes	14.69 minutes
Perris	4.40 minutes	8.61 minutes	12.85 minutes
San Jacinto	4.72 minutes	7.66 minutes	12.99 minutes
Temecula	5.36 minutes	9.56 minutes	15.06 minutes
Response Times to Calls for Unincorporated Areas Serviced by Riverside County Sheriff			
Cabazon	8.08 minutes	11.92 minutes	17.34 minutes
Hemet Area	10.88 minutes	15.24 minutes	19.70 minutes
March Air Force Base	2.43 minutes	9.60 minutes	14.42 minutes
Moreno Valley Area	7.80 minutes	15.45 minutes	18.64 minutes
Perris Area	8.28 minutes	13.16 minutes	18.43 minutes
Southwest	10.78 minutes	16.47 minutes	22.30 minutes
Response Times for City Police Departments			
Banning	3-7 minutes	n/a	n/a
Beaumont	4 minute average for all calls		
Hemet	7 minutes 12 seconds	12 minutes 20 seconds	30 minutes 48 seconds
Murrieta	5 minutes	10 minutes 6 seconds	20 minutes 35 seconds

Source: Riverside County Sheriff's Department, December 2005.

As shown in Table 3.B, current law enforcement staffing ranges from 0.83 to 1.79 sworn officers per 1,000 population. Overall, the city police departments have a higher level of staffing than the cities that contract with the County for services. Table 3.C shows that response times to high priority calls range from 3.87 minutes to 10.88 minutes. Response times in cities that have their own police departments are similar to response times of the cities that contract with the County for service. The longer or higher response times are those to calls within unincorporated areas being served directly by the County Sheriff's Department.

The law enforcement service costs per capita annually range from \$132.05 (for Calimesa, which provides the lowest number of officers-to-population ratio) to \$227.58 (for Beaumont, which provides the highest number of officers-to-population ratio). Contracting with the County

Sheriff’s Department appears less costly, averaging \$159.62 per capita annually in comparison to the city police department costs, which average \$187.35 per capita annually.

Fire Service Comparison

Fire services within the MSR area are provided by city fire departments, city and district contracts with the Riverside County Fire Department, and directly by the Riverside County Fire Department within unincorporated areas not being serviced by a CSA or special district. Tables 3.D and 3.E provide a comparison of fire service levels within the MSR area. It should be noted that the response times provided by the Riverside County Fire Department are times from when the call was dispatched to when the Fire Department arrives on scene. As shown in Table 3.D, a large majority of service calls were for medical aid, and a minority of the calls were fire-related. Table 3.E shows that response times range from 4 minutes to 24 minutes. Response times in cities that have their own fire departments are similar to response times of the cities that contract with the County for service. The longer or higher response times are those to calls within unincorporated areas being served directly by the County Fire Department.

The fire service costs per capita annually range from \$36.74 to \$122.72. Based on the response time information provided, it does not appear that the cost of providing services has affected response times. Contracting with the County Fire Department appears less costly, averaging \$59.46 per capita annually in comparison to the City fire department costs, which average \$99.29 per capita annually.

Table 3.D: Fire Service Calls for Service within Fiscal Year 2004–05

Station	Fires	Medical Aid	Hazmat	Miscellaneous	Total
Service Calls for Cities Contracting with the Riverside County Fire Department					
Serving Banning					
Station No. 89	122	1,241	3	212	1,578
Station No. 20	279	1,432	5	316	2,050
Serving Beaumont					
Station No. 66	257	822	16	365	1,460
Station No. 20	279	1,432	5	316	2,050
Serving Calimesa					
Station No. 21	168	1,327	5	299	1,799
Station No. 22	90	520	2	120	732

Station	Fires	Medical Aid	Hazmat	Miscellaneous	Total
Serving Moreno Valley					
Station No. 2	321	2,240	8	442	3,011
Station No. 6	337	2,047	7	580	2,971
Station No. 48	127	907	8	194	1,236
Station No. 58	91	968	14	128	1,201
Station No. 65	242	1,880	8	308	2,438
Station No. 91	205	1,114	5	251	1,575
Serving Perris					
Station No. 1	447	2,487	10	604	3,548
Station No. 3	98	346	4	134	582
Station No. 7	6	12	0	23	41
Station No. 9	250	405	8	114	777
Station No. 59	334	1,442	16	307	2,099
Station No. 91	205	1,114	5	251	1,575
Serving San Jacinto					
Station No. 25	357	2,610	14	577	3,558
Station No. 26	163	1,339	8	244	1,754
Station No. 72	97	1,060	5	182	1,344
Serving Temecula					
Station No. 12	211	711	8	373	1,303
Station No. 73	417	911	3	410	1,741
Station No. 83	115	631	4	181	931
Station No. 84	182	1,102	3	231	1,518
Station No. 92	219	582	6	219	1,026
Service Calls to Unincorporated Areas Serviced by Riverside County Fire					
Station No. 3	98	346	4	134	582
Station No. 4	90	262	3	100	455
Station No. 7	6	12	0	23	41
Station No. 9	250	405	8	114	777
Station No. 22	90	520	2	120	732
Station No. 24	131	478	7	244	860

Station	Fires	Medical Aid	Hazmat	Miscellaneous	Total
Station No. 26	163	1,339	8	244	1,754
Station No. 28	72	125	2	23	222
Station No. 34	85	293	7	190	575
Station No. 54	99	606	5	174	884
Station No. 59	334	1,442	16	307	2,099
Station No. 63	8	28	0	22	58
Station No. 68	142	464	4	137	747
Station No. 72	97	1,060	5	182	1,344
Station No. 75	79	297	7	120	503
Station No. 76	114	586	6	148	854
Station No. 83	115	631	4	181	931
Service Calls for City Fire Departments					
City of Hemet Fire*	369	8,442	n/a	390	10,942
City of Murrieta Fire	439	3,359	0	1,993	5,791

Source: Riverside County Fire Department, 2005.

Note: Some Stations are listed more than once, as they serve more than one City.

*Hemet data is from 2003.

Table 3.E: Fire Service Response Times within Fiscal Year 2004–05

Fire Station	Average Response Time
Cities Contracting with the County Fire Department	
Serving Banning	
Station No. 89	4:13 minutes
Station No. 20	4:24 minutes
Serving Beaumont	
Station No. 66	5:06 minutes
Station No. 20	4:24 minutes
Serving Calimesa	
Station No. 21	4:53 minutes

Fire Station	Average Response Time
Station No. 22	5:47 minutes
Serving Moreno Valley	
Station No. 2	4:02 minutes
Station No. 6	4:34 minutes
Station No. 48	4:02 minutes
Station No. 65	3:59 minutes
Station No. 58	5:06 minutes
Station No. 91	4:29 minutes
Serving Perris	
Station No. 1	4:22 minutes
Station No. 3	4:47 minutes
Station No. 7	3:54 minutes
Station No. 9	7:01 minutes
Station No. 59	5:39 minutes
Station No. 90	4:54 minutes
Station No. 91	4:29 minutes
Serving San Jacinto	
Station No. 25	4:15 minutes
Station No. 26	4:34 minutes
Station No. 72	3:49 minutes
Serving Temecula	
Station No. 12	4:27 minutes
Station No. 73	3:55 minutes
Station No. 83	6:20 minutes
Station No. 84	4:57 minutes
Station No. 92	5:07 minutes
Unincorporated Areas Serviced by County Fire	
Station No. 3	5:42 minutes
Station No. 4	7:23 minutes
Station No. 7	3:54 minutes
Station No. 9	7:01 minutes

Fire Station	Average Response Time
Station No. 22	5:47 minutes
Station No. 24	7:05 minutes
Station No. 26	4:34 minutes
Station No. 28	11:17 minutes
Station No. 34	6:13 minutes
Station No. 54	5:26 minutes
Station No. 59	5:39 minutes
Station No. 63	24:00 minutes
Station No. 68	5:40 minutes
Station No. 72	3:49 minutes
Station No. 75	8:39 minutes
Station No. 76	4:35 minutes
Station No. 83	6:20 minutes
City Fire Departments	
City of Hemet Fire	5:00 minutes
City of Murrieta Fire	4:20 EMS 5:38 Fire

Source: Riverside County Fire Department, June 2006.

Parks and Recreation Services

Park and recreational services within the MSR area are provided by cities, special districts, and CSAs. Table 3.F provides a comparison of existing park and recreational services. In addition, the Riverside County Regional Park and Open Space District provides several regional facilities within the MSR area, as identified within each agency’s section of this document. The regional facilities are listed in Table X. Because the regional facilities are large-scale and designed to serve residents from all over the County, they are not included in Table 3.F, which lists agencies serving the local population.

As shown in Table 3.F, the existing ratio of parkland per 1,000 population ranges from 1.5 acres per 1,000 population to 8.68 acres per 1,000 population. All of the agencies, except for the cities of Hemet and Murrieta, currently provide parkland at a ratio that is lower than the adopted standard or objective. Half of the agencies that provide park and recreational services within this MSR are planning additional facilities. Also, half of the agencies are providing recreational programs.

Table 3.F: Comparison of Park and Recreational Services

	Banning	Beaumont	Calimesa	Hemet	Moreno Valley	Murrieta	Perris
Agency Standard Per 1,000 Population	5 acres	5 acres	5 acres	5 acres	3 acres	5 acres	5 acres
Existing Ratio Per 1,000 Population	2.39 acres	3.0 acres*	1.5 acres	8.68 acres	2.0 acres	6.23	4.63 acres
Total Existing Acreage	66.90	57	109.30	576.70	329.84	531	206.70
Planned Facilities	158 acres	None	1,130+ acres	None	424.95 acres	73.5 acres	260± acres
Recreation Programs Provided	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
	San Jacinto	Temecula	Beaumont-Cherry Valley	Valley-Wide	CSA 85	CSA 143	CSA 145
Agency Standard Per 1,000 Population	5 acres	5 acres	5 acres	3 acres	3 acres	3 acres	3 acres
Existing Ratio Per 1,000 Population	1.72*	2.95	2.46	3.04***	0.0027 per parcel**	0.0038 per parcel**	0.0055 per parcel**
Total Existing Acreage	48.90	240.21	61.5	487	9	21	31
Planned Facilities	57 acres	44	No	No	No	No	No
Recreation Programs Provided	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	No

* Not including Park and Recreation District facilities (Beaumont = 6.19 acres, San Jacinto = 2.99 acres including District facilities)

** Population data for specific CSAs are not available; hence, parcel information is used.

***Not including parks in planning, streetscapes, detention basins, and entry detail.

In addition to the cost information in Table 3.A, in FY 2004–05 the Valley-Wide Recreation and Park District provided services at a cost of \$42.73 per capita annually and the Beaumont-Cherry Valley Recreation and Park District provided services at a cost of \$27.65 per capita annually. The park and recreational costs per capita annually range from \$10.65 to \$92.01. Due to the various different amenities and facilities and the different types of programs that are provided, it is difficult to determine the direct correlation between cost of service per capita and level of service.

Library Services

Library services within the MSR area are provided by cities, cities as participants in the County Library System, and by the County System directly in unincorporated areas. The County Library does not have specific service standards and provides services based upon demands within local areas. Typically, the library coordinates facilities and services with the local jurisdictions surrounding each library facility. However, some of the cities within this MSR have established library service standards as listed:

- City of Hemet: 2.5 books and 0.5 square feet per capita.
- Moreno Valley: 0.5 gross square feet of library space and 1.2 volumes per capita.
- City of San Jacinto: 935 square feet of library space and 3,178 volumes per 1,000 dwelling units.

Table 3.G provides a comparison of library services. As shown, the three cities that have adopted library service standards are currently below their goal. As shown, the overall volumes per capita range from 0.41 to 2.14 and the square footage per capita ranges from 0.29 to 0.77. However, it should be noted that because library services are free, residents from other cities and the unincorporated areas can utilize any library facility. Therefore, a margin of error exists in what population is truly being served by each library facility. Also, it should be noted that within the City of Hemet, both a City and County library exist. Residents from Hemet and the surrounding area most likely utilize both facilities. Because the City provides a facility not within the County system, the City’s library is listed under the City in Table 3.G and the Valle Vista County Library that is located within Hemet is listed under Additional Library facilities.

Table 3.G: Comparison of Library Services

	Volumes	Square Footage	Annual Circulation	Volumes per Capita	Square Footage per Capita
Cities Participating in the County Library System					
Calimesa	9,300	2,400	27,181	1.25	0.32
Perris	95,622	20,000	177,773	2.14	0.45
San Jacinto	42,942	10,000	52,228	1.51	0.35
Temecula	111,967	15,380	440,809	1.99 upon second facility opening	0.63 upon second facility opening
Temecula 2nd facility*	50,000 additional	36,000*			
City Libraries					
Hemet	103,475	51,010	398,140	1.56	0.77
Moreno Valley	98,000	16,000**	375,485	0.59	0.097

	Volumes	Square Footage	Annual Circulation	Volumes per Capita	Square Footage per Capita
Murrieta	35,000	25,000*	146,727	0.41	0.29
Library District Facilities					
Banning Library District	61,000	10,873	127,000	2.24	0.36
Beaumont Library District	60,425	12,000	110,250	1.37	0.27
Additional County Libraries within Unincorporated Areas					
Nuview Library	21,929	2,160	14,764	n/a	n/a
Paloma Library	14,300	5,000	29,809	n/a	n/a
Sun City Library	59,900	6,700	174,899	n/a	n/a
Thousand Palms Library	16,000	590	8,342	n/a	n/a
Valle Vista	37,973	5,000	62,654	n/a	n/a

*Under development.

** Moreno Valley is planning a new facility.

In addition to the cost information in Table 3.A, in FY 2004–05 the Beaumont Library District provided services at a cost of \$13.16 per capita, and the Banning Library District provided services at a cost of \$14.07 per capita within the FY 2005-06.

The County Library System is funded by a library tax district, which is levied within unincorporated areas and the cities that participate in the County System. Based upon the State Department of Finance 2005 population estimate for the entire County FY 2004–05 cost for County Library services was \$5.90 per capita. The population of the entire County was used because the unincorporated population within the MSR area is not tracked and because residents within both the unincorporated and city areas can utilize the County system. However, it should be noted that many cities provide their own library services, and that this County per capita cost is low, as the city facilities are not taken into account. However, it can be assumed that many residents with City facilities utilize the County system. Within the Cities that provide library services independently from the County System, costs per capita in FY 2004–05 ranged from \$9.61 to \$24.94. Due to the different arrangements between ownership of facilities, collections, and equipment, and that several new facilities are being developed, it is difficult to determine the direct correlation between the cost of service per capita and level of service.

It should also be noted that many cities both participating in the County System and providing independent libraries own the library facilities. The costs of the facilities are in addition to the costs listed above. The cities that own the library facilities are listed below:

- Calimesa
- Hemet
- Moreno Valley
- Murrieta
- Temecula

Solid Waste

Solid waste services among all of the agencies (except for the City of Hemet) providing this service within the MSR are provided through service contracts with solid waste collection companies. The levels of services provided by all of the agencies are very similar. The rates levied by the agencies are designed to cover the costs of the services and vary depending on the service being provided (e.g., size of refuse bin and number of pickups). Table 3.H provides the existing rates for solid waste services. As shown, residential rates for the lowest level of service range from \$14.16 to \$22.68 and starter commercial/industrial service rates range from \$16.40 to \$97.44.

Table 3.H: Monthly Solid Waste Rates for Service Providers within this MSR

	Banning	Beaumont	Calimesa	Hemet	Moreno Valley
Residential	\$14.16	\$18.50	30-gallon: \$17.66 60-gallon: \$19.95 90-gallon: \$22.77	60-gallon: \$14.60 additional bins: \$9.55 90-gallon: \$17.35 additional bins: \$14.10	\$18.67–\$16.92
Commercial and Industrial	\$16.40–124.86	\$78.57–\$978.29	\$73.41–627.25	\$21.15–1,368.00	\$71.58–\$865.81
	Murrieta	Perris	San Jacinto	Temecula	Santa Rosa CSD
Residential	\$15.31	60-gallon: \$14.50 100-gallon: \$18.49 additional receptacles: \$5.66 or \$6.68	\$15.65	\$15.45 + \$6.34 per container	1 bin: \$22.68 2 bins: \$31.28 3 bins: \$39.36
Commercial and Industrial	\$75.27–\$1,300	\$97.44–\$597.82	\$92.88–\$883.12	\$73.77–\$1,300	\$57.78–\$98.66

Note: Commercial and industrial rates are dependent on size of bin and number of pickups

Note: All of the agencies contract for services, and costs are passed on to customers based on the service received. Service details are provided within each agency’s MSR section.